

POVERTY AND HUMAN DEVELOPMENT REPORT 2011 (PHDR 2011)

Review

Marjorie Mbilinyi, Tanzania Gender Networking Programme (TGNP) On behalf of CSOs-JPE

1. The Tanzanian Gender Networking Programme (TGNP) has carried out a review of the PHDR 2011 from a transformative feminist perspective, adopting the gaze of marginalized peoples with whom we work, and marginalized women in particular. We endeavoured to understand the main findings of the report, with respect to the three areas of growth and income poverty, quality of life and social well-being, and governance and accountability. We questioned the underlying and basic causes for the problems and challenges noted; and analysed the implications for marginalized women and their communities. Of special concern to us has been the implications for achieving sustainable and dignified employment and livelihoods for all, which is the focus of our Economic Justice Campaign.
2. *PHDR 2011 provides us with ample information to reflect on the **meaning** of the 'findings' with respect to poverty and inequality, social well-being and governance, to analyse the often unspoken causes for the existing situation, and to reflect on what changes are necessary in structures, policies and budgets to achieve our ultimate goal, which is the reduction of inequality and poverty and the promotion of participatory democracy and development and sustainable growth in Tanzania*

3. **What are, to us, the most significant findings of the report?**

- *'Jobless growth'* is a major problem and source of further impoverishment in spite of relatively high GDP; joblessness is associated with the decline of peasant agriculture, informalisation and casualisation of labour, and the shift of responsibility for provision of cash needs from men to women in many households and/or joint responsibility with contradictory outcomes for changes in gender relations;

The lack of dignified employment alternatives has forced many children, youth and women and men to turn to pimping and prostitution as a last resort .. or bar girl work, domestic work, and/or petty trade .. all highly vulnerable occupations to sexual abuse and HIV infection, the lack of self-respect, and growing insecurity and despair;

According to PHDR 2011 (xv), "the second phase of MKUKUTA (2010-2015) seeks to accelerate the reduction of income poverty by promoting job creation and income generation that is associated with increased labour productivity. Raising labour productivity lies at the heart of the reduction of decent work deficits and is intrinsically related to overall development. Interventions will be directed towards facilitating productivity enhancement through easier access to productive assets and decent jobs, especially for women and for young people, who form the largest share of the labour force."

The government's recognition that there can be no reduction of poverty without the expansion of employment and livelihoods is a positive development. However, we believe that more analysis is needed to understand the causes of the lack of viable, dignified employment, in order to develop realistic strategies to achieve full employment and

- livelihoods for all – increasing labour productivity is not enough. In fact, *without an alternative development strategy, increasing labour productivity will actually benefit a few more well to do women and men with access to enough land, capital and other assets, but drive the majority of workers and peasants out of their jobs and livelihoods* – i.e. more of the same.
- *Growth has not led to a significant reduction of poverty, according to the report.. We propose, therefore, that the government use this as evidence to question the present neoliberal macroeconomic framework, and look for an alternative people-centred macro economic framework.* Moreover, the present export oriented growth strategy has failed to provide sustainable and holistic development involving all areas of the country; instead, it made the national economy vulnerable to the shocks emanating from the recent 2008/09 global fiscal/economic crisis as shown by the dramatic fall in horticulture and tourist industry output and profits in 2009 and 2010.
 - The continued high level of donor dependence for budget revenues is highly questionable in the context of the wealth of natural and human resources in Tanzania, and can only be explained by the failure of these resources to be properly exploited for the benefit of all Tanzanians, on an equitable and just basis. Under present conditions of capital flight, surely the amount of money and wealth exported from Tanzania is much more than the amount of external finance through loans and grants. Capital flight consists not only of the commodities and profits exported outside of Tanzania by foreign and local corporations because of inappropriate investment and taxation/royalties policies. Corruption, especially grand corruption, has led to major misappropriation of public revenue, the diversion of funds and/or projects to unplanned activities and the export of stolen funds abroad in offshore banks. Donor dependence is even more problematic at the present time, given the continued fiscal crisis as shown in EU currency and debt crises; there has been a fall in donor funding, delayed disbursements, and a tightening up of conditionalities, contrary to the earlier emphasis on country ownership.
 - Continued high HIV prevalence rates, high malnutrition rates with wasting and stunting of substantial numbers of children, high maternal and neonate mortality rates are indicators of *the crisis of reproduction for a large proportion of the population*; The crisis of reproduction is associated with the *export-oriented growth strategy* based on a few high growth industries [namely mining, tourism, horticulture and the banking sector of services] which lack horizontal and vertical linkages with the rest of the economy and employ very few women and men; *the withdrawal of the state from provision of quality public social services* – a major policy of structural adjustment, and *the lack of adequate social protection mechanisms* to support, for example, the growing number of orphans, street children, landless beggars, unemployed and the elderly who are no longer able to provide for themselves; In addition, the crisis of reproduction has additional costs in economic terms [malnourished infants and children grow up to be less productive adults given the impact on mental and physical capacity; increase the costs of provision of health care; and so on]. A vicious circle is created, in that, women and men intentionally bear as many children as possible in order to ensure that some of their children survive and are able to care for them in old age, in the absence of viable social security.

- One indicator of the crisis of reproduction is the *steady deskilling and de-education of the Tanzanian population* associated with the decline of the public education system, as indicated by the rise of illiteracy rates compared to the early 1980s; the dramatic decline in Division 1-3 pass rate in Form 4 exams; and the extremely low transition rate to tertiary education, with girls systematically discriminated against at all levels of education through male dominated gender stereotyping in the curricula, male biased teaching methodology, the lack of provision of appropriate boarding facilities especially in ward secondary schools, as well as outright sexual abuse and rape
- *Steady decline of peasant agriculture* on which some 74% people depend as part/full employment, caused in part by state withdrawal of support to the peasant economy, beginning in the mid 1980s as a result of SAP; priority is now given to largescale commercial agriculture as shown in Kilimo Kwanza and related budget policies . The lack of a viable rural development strategy which links farming, livestock-keeping and fishing to smallscale industry [including services] with adequate support for all forms of infrastructure has contributed to the growing stagnancy in many peasant communities/economies. Young people reject the lifetime of drudgery experienced by their mothers, in particular, and look for any kind of off-farm work within the community or outside. They correctly have higher expectations for themselves. The outcome, however, is that there is a steady loss of young productive labour in local peasant economies/communities.
- *Crisis in security of land tenure for peasant households*; PHDR says this is due to lack of land titles; whereas in reality a major cause of the land crisis is the rapid expansion of land grabbing, beginning in 2008, by largescale agribusiness along with mining corporations, tourist corporations ... with lack of grassroots participation in decision-making, lack of fair compensation, and lack of employment and livelihoods alternatives. Related to this is the persistence of patriarchal gender relations whereby children, youth and women are deprived of access to and ownership of land and other productive assets.

4. What are the underlying and basic causes of the situation noted above and/or their implications?

- *Class inequalities and class polarization are increasing, with the steady growth of two worlds, one of the rich and one of the poor, with entirely different life chances in education, health, housing, employment and livelihoods.* These inequalities are reinforced by government policies and strategies directly and indirectly, a good example being the *'quick wins' strategy* adopted in several recent national budgets and in the Five Year Development Plan which argues that priority in resource allocations should go to more productive areas/sectors with the quickest return, under the assumption that the benefits will eventually trickle down to less advantaged areas [be it sectors of industry, agro-economic zones, regions or districts]. Kilimo Kwanza strategy calls for more resources to the commercial private sector, as shown in the kind of tax benefits/exemptions adopted, and the pattern of investments associated with SAGCOT and other agriculture programmes.
- *The growing insecurity of employment, livelihoods and incomes* of the majority of the people, and the crisis of reproduction it entails, are resulting from the *crisis of global finance capital* and the desperate search for natural resources needed to enable capitalism to survive and accumulate; we are in the midst of what is called the third scramble for Africa

on a par with that of the 1880s when Europe colonized Africa, in a context where capital has no need for healthy, skilled labour

- In the context of intensified *primitive accumulation through plunder by global* capital, there is increasing *militarization of society and economy* in Tanzania and rest of eastern Africa, as different big powers seek to defend their control over the contested resources as well as to protect their strategic and security interests
- In place of the strong national identity and an ideology [*socialism and self-reliance*] which most Tanzanians embraced in the 1960s and 1970s, and which provided pride, hope and a sense of direction, neoliberalism has brought individualism and greed, as 'each person for herself' takes the place of communal support systems; but also, as people look for an alternative ideology, the growing power of fundamentalisms including far right Christian fundamentalism and Islamic fundamentalism with external funding, and traditionalisms with high sexism and horrific forms of witchcraft, sexual abuse and rape ... leading to a highly volatile situation with growing ethnic/religious/political conflict and violence
- In this context, the majority of young women and men are expelled and marginalized; have low expectations for themselves; they are denied independent access to land and other productive assets within their families and communities as well as a voice in terms of allocation of family resources and labour, due to the ever-resilient patriarchal structure prevalent in most locations; they are alienated by patriarchy as well as by neoliberal modernization processes in schools; a floating 'surplus' just waiting for someone to light a match! Does Tanzania have the right conditions [decades of organizing by trade unions, strong left social movements of other kinds, plus a highly urbanized and educated population of *youth*] to lead to progressive calls for democracy as found in Tunisia and Egypt and elsewhere in North Africa and the Middle East? Or are these the ideal conditions for the rise of totalitarianism and fascism?
- Whose interests are served by such conditions?? We can learn from what happened in Mobutu's Zaire, or apartheid South Africa, where multinational corporations thrived in the midst of appalling oppression, inequality and injustice.

5. **What are our major Recommendations to Government?**

- Carry out a serious review of the present export oriented growth strategy, given the findings of the PHDR 2011 [and other sources of information], and develop and implement a people-centred development strategy which combines balanced growth with equality and justice.

Immediate steps need to be taken to adopt appropriate tax and royalty policies which ensure that largescale corporations provide an adequate share of their profits to the government and the communities in which they operate. As is found in other developing countries, foreign investors should be expected to reinvest up to 70% of their profits in the national economy [through which they will continue to extract profits] and employ local citizens .

- The major priority in the immediate and short term ought to be the achievement of full decent employment and sustainable livelihoods for all women and men in rural and urban

- areas, which can only be achieved with balanced growth whose foundation lies in the expansion of both domestic and export trade in a holistic way. Of special concern are young women and men, the most marginalized of the marginalized, and most vulnerable to exploitation, abuse, violence, and HIV. Related to this, basic socio-economic rights must be enshrined in the new Constitution, including the right to employment and sustainable livelihoods for all women and men, and the means to achieve them.
- Measures need to be adopted and/or strengthened in land policy and law to protect the communal rights to land of the local community, and the land/property rights of women and youth in particular, and ensure that these rights are enshrined in the new Constitution, with appropriate measures to regulate and control investment strategies so as not to undermine the well-being and livelihoods of the Tanzanian people.
 - In the context of the present neoliberal capitalist economy and the negative impact of globalization, adequate social protection measures need to be adopted and strengthened and adequate resources provided to ensure that every Tanzanian has access to a basic livable income, through social security measures such as school lunches, minimum monthly allowances for all elderly people 60 years and above and mothers of children younger than 5 years of age [as is found in South Africa], and specific programmes for orphans, and people living with disability and HIV.